IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION IA NO. 135012 of 2017

IN

CIVIL APPEAL NO. 13301 of 2015

IN THE MATTER OF :

SUBHRATA BHATTACHARYA

... Appellant

VERSUS

SEBI

A

Ł

... Respondent

INDEX

S. No	Particulars	Pages
1.	Objections on behalf of Applicant to the Hon'ble Justice Lodha Committee Report filed on 30.08.2019	1-2
2.	Annexure A Comparative Chart of Bids	3

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION

CIVIL APPEAL NO. 13301 of 2015

IN THE MATTER OF :

SUBHRATA BHATTACHARYA

VERSUS

SEBI

1.

... Respondent

... Appellant

IN THE MATTER OF:

IA NO. 135012 of 2017

FILED BY AKSHAT AGGARWAL

... Applicant

1

OBJECTIONS ON BEHALF OF MR. AKSHAT AGGARWAL TO THE HON'BLE JUSTICE LODHA COMMITTEE REPORT FILED ON 30.08.2019

MOST RESPECTFULLY SHOWETH:

- 1. That the applicant had made bidding with respect to 33 properties of PACL in January, 2017 out of which he was declared successful in 3 properties. Apart from that the applicant was the highest bidder (H-1) in another 13 properties. The MR No. of said 13 properties are 7775-16, 2030-14, 4244-15, 2027-14, 4271-15, 4273-15, 4277-15, 4278-15, 4330-15, 2023-14, 2075-14,4353-15. In the above Properties, the property bearing M.R. No. 7775-16 is a residential property whereas the other 12 properties are agricultural one.
- 2. That despite Applicant being the highest bidder (H-1), he did not receive any intimation with respect to the deposit of the balance amount of bid. However, on 04.05.2017 Applicant received an e-mail from the auctioning agency that the committee has not approved the sale of 13 properties for which the applicant has submitted H-1 bids. In the said mail no reason was given for not approving the sale with respect to the aforesaid 13 properties in which undisputedly he was the highest and successful bidder.
- 3. That with respect to MR No. 7775-16 which is a residential property, the applicant had made a bid of Rs.

8,52,73,656/against the reserve price of Rs. 5,26,38,034/-. However, now as per the bids submitted by ARCIL and Prudent, which is part of the Justice Lodha Committee report the same property has been bid for a much less amount of Rs. 6,35,00,000/- and Rs. 6,85,30,000/- respectively. It is thus clear that in bid of the aforesaid property an amount less than 34% of the bid amount offered by the applicant, is offered for which the property is now being sold for a lesser value of Rs 2,17,73,656/- which itself is against the interest of the investors. The applicant is still ready to purchase the said property on the price of H-1 bid offered by him.

- 4. That with respect to the other 12 properties which are Agricultural properties in which the applicant was successful, the bid of ARCIL and Prudent are although higher but is still fetching much less price as expected from those properties. The potential value of the said agricultural properties has increased after the notification of the land pool policy by the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs vide gazette notification dated 11.10.2018 where the land use has been permitted for other purposes as well. Further the aforesaid properties are offered for the price less than the book value which is contrary to the stand taken by SEBI in its reply. Apart from that had those properties been given to the Applicant in the year 2017, during the last three years, the amount of interest would have been much higher than the increased value offered by ARCIL and Prudent. There is also no competitive process in the bids submitted before Lodha Committee as these three biders have not bidded for all the same properties and bid is submitted by them selectively picking the properties out of pool of 27,500 properties. The Applicant is ready to match the bid of ARCIL and Prudent and offer higher value for those 13 properties.
- 5. That all the aforesaid aspects has not been apprised to the Hon'ble Justice Lodha Committee which has resulted in gross undervaluation of the properties and therefore the Applicant is raising strong objection to the same. The Applicant has enclosed a comparative chart of Bids with respect to all the above 13 properties which is enclosed as **Annexure A**.

Submitted By

TEMP

(Ritesh Agrawal) Counsel for Applicant

S

Fighest Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Sino MR No Details Avea (n Reserve Price Eamest H1 Bid Subnitted ArCL Bid Price Difference	22,58,66,438 (15)
IPPOPERTIES Bid Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Eids Bid Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Eids Bid Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Eids Bid Submitted Act and by Akshat Aggarwal Act and bid act and bin Add and Add Add Add Add Add	
Properties Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Earnest H1 Bid Submitted By Akshat Aggarwal Eids Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Eids Bidsubnitted Arc1 Bid Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Aggarwal Arc1 Bid Submitted Arc1 Bid Submitted Aggarwal Arc1 Bid Submitted Arc1 Bid Submitted Aggarwal Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Aggarwal Arc1 Bid Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Aggarwal Arc1 Bid Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Aggarwal Arc1 Bid Submitted Arc1 Bid Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Aggarwal Arc1 Bid Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Aggarwal Arc21 Bid Submitted Arc1 Bid Frie Difference Percentage of Deposit Agricultural Land in A042 1,92,69,236 1,92,69,236 Aggarwal CI17,13,656 CI17,13,656 CI17,13,656 1,11,13,853 2,12,12,81,92 2,86,98,200 (17,15,648) (25) 1 2007.14 Agricultural Land in Bid Submitted Definit 3.385 1,61,41,19 1,63,02,251 2,03,40,000 (40,37,449) (20) (20) (20) (21,43,932) (20) (21,44,932) (20) (21,44,932) (20) (21,44,932) (18)	1 89 47 000 / 150 10 1 201 (15)
Properties Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Earnest High Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bid Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest Bids Submitted Arcu Bid Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest High Submitted Arcu Bid Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest High Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest High Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest High Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest Mig Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest High Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Submitted Arcu Bid Price Difference Bids Earnest High Submitted Arcu Price Difference Bids Submitted Arcu Price Difference Bids Submitted Arcu Price Difference Bidd Price Difference Percentage of Difference Bercentage of Difference Definient Definient Bud No.73,146 Auguru File Marcu Percentage of Dof 7,315 Auguru File Marcu Percentage Definient Aggarwal Price Difference Bercentage of Dof 7,315 Auguru File Marcu Percentage of Dof 7,315 Auguru File Marcu 	1,47,00,560 (21,54,033)
Properties Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bid Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bid Submitted Bid Submitted Money MRNo Details Area (in Area (in Area (in Area (in Bid Accut I and in Bid) Colspan="4">Bid Submitted Money Alkshat ARCIL Bid Submitted Money Arcal Enters Bid Submitted Money Arcal Enters Bid Submitted Money Arcut Bid Submitted Money Price Difference Percenage of Bid Money 1775-16 Residential Land in Bid Submitted Arcut 19,269,236 19,269,236 19,269,24 2,15,81,552 2,86,98,200 (71,16,648) (75) 2030-14 Agricultural Land in Defhi 3.85 1,61,41,139 16,14,114 1,63,02,551 2,03,40,000 (71,16,648) (75) 2027-14 Agricultural Land in Defhi 5.5 2,60,26,083 26,02,609 2,62,28,344 3,28,20,000 (71,16,648) (75) 2027-14 Agricultural Land in Defhi 1.95 2,60,26,083 26,02,609 2,62,28,344 3,28,20,000 <t< td=""><td>1,04,52,925 (16,17,563)</td></t<>	1,04,52,925 (16,17,563)
Properties Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bids Chi Bid Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bids Being MR No Details Area (n Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of by Akshat ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of by Akshat Percentage of by Akshat Price Difference Percentage of by Akshat Price Difference Percentage of by Akshat Percentage of by Akshat Percentage of by Akshat Price Difference Percentage of by Akshat Percentage of by Akshat Price Difference Percentage of by Akshat Percentage o	1,65,57,338 (21,30,679) (113)
Properties Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bids By Akshat Aggarwal Bids Being MR No Details Area (in acres) Reserve Price acres) Earnest by Akshat H Bid Submitted by Akshat ARCIL Bid Price Difference Bid Price Dif	1,08,57,825 (15,78,769) (15)
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in acres) Reserve Price (money) Earnest by Akshat H Bid Submitted Submitted ARCIL Bid (H1 Bid ARCIL Bid) Price Difference (H1 Bid ARCIL Bid) Price Difference Bid) Price	66,52,250 (10,22,858) (15)
Properties Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in acres) Reserve Price Earnest Money H1 Bid Submitted by Akshat ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of Bid 7175-16 Residential Land in Building 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 52,63,804 8,52,73,556 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Bid Difference Percentage of Bid	1,10,38,225 (14,23,15,7) (13)
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in acres) Reserve Price acres) Earnest Money H Bid Submitted by Akshat ARCIL Bid Aggarwal Price Difference Bid Price Difference Bid Percentage of Bid 775-16 Residential Land in Building 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 Bid Difference Bid Percentage of Bid 775-16 Residential Land in Building 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 34 7030-14 Agricultural Land in Delhi 4,042 1,92,69,236 19,26,924 2,15,81,552 2,86,98,200 (71,16,648) (25) 2027-14 Agricultural Land in Delhi 3.385 1,61,41,139 16,14,114 1,63,02,551 2,03,40,0000 (40,37,449) (20) 2000-14 Agricultural Land in 5.5 2,60,26,083 26,07,609 5,58,534 5,58,534 5,56,534 5,59,534 5,03,40,0000 (40,37,449) (20) 2000-14 Agricultural Land in 5.5 2,60,26,083 26,07,609 5,58,534 5,59,534 5,59,534 5,59,534 <	3,10,06,250 (47,19,906) (15)
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price arres) Earnest Money H1 Bid Submitted Money ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of Bid Accult bid Accult bid Accult bid Bid Details Area (in Reserve Price for Bid Submitted Money Bid Submitted by Akshat ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of Bid Accult bid Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Accult bid Bid Difference Standard Bid Difference Bid Accult Bid Difference Bid Accult Bid Difference Bid Accult Bid Difference Bid Bid Difference Bid Accult Bid Difference <td>1,90,82,938 (27,80,387) (15)</td>	1,90,82,938 (27,80,387) (15)
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of Bid 1775-16 Residential Land in Building 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 Bid Difference Percentage of Bid Bid Difference Bid Bid Bid Difference Bid Bid Bid Bid Difference Bid Bid Bid Difference Bid Bid Bid Bid Statistical Actin Bid Statistical Actical Actical Actin Bid	
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (n Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of MR No Details Area (n Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of 1775-16 Residential Land in 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 Bid 1775-16 Residential Land in 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 34 1775-16 Residential Land in 4,042 1,92,69,236 19,26,924 2,15,81,552 2,86,98,200 (71,16,648) 94 2030-14 Agricultural Land in 4,042 1,92,69,236 19,26,924 2,15,81,552 2,86,98,200 (71,16,648) 954	1-
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of MR No Bid arrest Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H2 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of MR No Bid arrest 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656 34	2,27,86,775 (12,05,223)
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of 1775-16 Residential Land in 5,26,38,034 52,63,804 8,52,73,656 6,35,00,000 2,17,73,656	
Properties Bid by Akshat Aggarwal MR No Details Area (in acces) Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of therence MR No Details Area (in acces) Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of therence MR No Details Area (in acces) Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of therence Money by Akshat Deposit Aggarwal (H1 Bid-ARCIL Difference	
Properties Bid by Akshat Ag Highest Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bids Being MR No Details Area (in Reserve Price Earnest H1 Bid Submitted ARCIL Bid Price Difference Percentage of	
Highest Bids(H1 Bid) Submitted by Akshat Aggarwal Bids Bid by Akshat Aggarwal Bids Being	IUIH Bid Price Difference Decontant of
Properties Bid by Akshat Ag	Considered by SEBI and comparison with H1 Bid
	garwal

ω